

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: West/Centre Area
Date: 31 July 2007

Ward: Guildhall
Parish: Guildhall Planning Panel

Reference: 07/01161/CAC
Application at: Charlie Brown Autocentres 31 Bootham York YO30 7BT
For: Demolition of building in the Conservation Area (resubmission)
By: Bootham Row Ltd
Application Type: Conservation Area Consent
Target Date: 10 July 2007

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The application relates to the demolition of buildings previously occupied by the former Charlie Browns Autocentre in Bootham in association with the redevelopment of the site for retail, office and residential development, a proposal which is considered separately on this agenda (06/00202/FULM). The buildings are situated within a designated conservation area (Central Historic Core), hence separate conservation area consent is required for the demolition of the buildings. The buildings consist of a modern two storey flat roofed showroom/office at the front of the site, with a mixture of one and two storey brick and pantile buildings at the rear, fronting onto Bootham Row.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area Central Historic Core 0038

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings Grade 2; 33 Bootham York YO3 7BT 0607

2.2 Policies:

CYHE5

Demolition of Listed Buildings and Buildings in Conservation Areas

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL

DESIGN, CONSERVATION AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Conservation - No objections

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE - No objections

3.2 EXTERNAL

GUILDHALL PLANNING PANEL - No objections

ADJACENT OCCUPIERS - No replies received

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 Key Issues

- architectural quality of building
- impact on character and appearance of the conservation area

4.2 The application relates to the demolition of a range of buildings associated with the former Charlie Browns Autocentre in Bootham, to allow the redevelopment of the site for retail, office and residential purposes. Policy E4 of the Approved North Yorkshire Structure Plan states that buildings and areas of special townscape, architectural or historic interest will be afforded the strictest protection. Policy HE5 of the City of York Deposit Draft Local Plan states that conservation area consent will not be granted for the demolition of buildings which positively contribute to the character or appearance of conservation areas. Where exceptionally demolition or partial demolition is permitted, Policy HE5 requires that no demolition takes place until a building contract for the carrying out of works of redevelopment has been made, and planning permission for those works has been granted.

4.3 Central Government advice in relation to demolition within conservation areas is contained within Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 (PPG15) - "Planning and the Historic Environment". In exercising conservation area controls, Local Planning Authorities are required to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the area in question. Account should be taken of the part played in the architectural or historic interest of the area by the building for which demolition is proposed, and the wider effects of demolition on the surroundings and on the conservation area as a whole.

4.3 PPG15 states that the general presumption should be in favour of retaining buildings which make a positive contribution to the character or appearance of a conservation area. The Secretary of State expects that proposals to demolish such buildings should be considered against the same broad criteria to demolish listed buildings. Where a building makes little or no contribution, full information about what

is proposed for the site after demolition should be provided. Consent for demolition should not be given unless there are acceptable and detailed plans for any redevelopment. It has been held that the decision maker is entitled to consider the merits of any proposed development in determining whether consent should be given for the demolition of an unlisted building in a conservation area.

4.4 The existing building on the front of the site occupies a prominent position in the streetscene and is an unattractive two storey structure of modern appearance with a flat roof. The building is of no architectural merit and has few, if any, redeeming features, and is considered to have a negative impact on the character and appearance of the streetscene. The buildings at the rear are of more traditional construction and appearance, being of brick construction with pantiled roofs. However, they are of utilitarian appearance and are not considered to be of listable quality. Nor are they particularly prominent in the streetscene. It is considered that the opportunity that exists for the redevelopment of the whole site should be taken into account in determining this application for the demolition of the buildings.

4.5 In this particular case, it is considered that the proposed proposals for the site, as set out in the previous item on the agenda, are acceptable and would result in the redevelopment of a site that has had a negative impact on the streetscene for a number of years. It is considered that the proposal would result in an overall enhancement of this part of the conservation area, in addition to securing much needed highway improvements along Bootham Row. No objections are raised, therefore, to the demolition of the existing buildings. However, it is considered that the imposition of the standard condition requiring a contract for the redevelopment of the site to be made prior to the demolition of the existing building is justified in this instance, in order to avoid the possibility of a cleared site within the conservation area, in the event that the redevelopment proposals do not take place.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 Bearing in mind the architectural quality of the buildings that it is proposed to demolish, and the merits of the alternative proposals for the site, it is not considered that the character or appearance of the conservation area would be adversely affected by the proposal. The redevelopment proposals for the site are considered to be acceptable. As such, the granting of conservation area consent is considered to be acceptable, and not in conflict with Policy E4 of the Approved North Yorkshire Structure Plan or Policy HE5 of the Draft Local Plan.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

- 1 TIMEL2 Commence within three years
- 2 DEM1 Contract for redevelopment prior to demolition

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to:

- architectural quality of building
- impact on character and appearance of the conservation area

As such the proposal complies with Policy E4 of the North Yorkshire County Structure Plan (Alteration No.3 Adopted 1995) and Policy HE5 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

Contact details:

Author: Simon Glazier Assistant Area Team Leader
Tel No: 01904 551351